

**A Comparative Study between Abu-Dib's and Anani's
Translations of *Orientalism***

Nadia Ahmed

In my thesis "*Abu-Dib's Translation of Orientalism: A Critical Study*", too many defects and inaccuracies were recorded in that translation; a recommendation was also given of retranslating the book. A new translation of *Orientalism* by M. Anani was issued in 2006. This paper aims to prove, through comparison instances of the two translations, that the criticism and recommendations of the thesis are justified and also that the translation of Anani meets most of the requirements of its recommendations.

Anani defines his method of translation by stating that it is more similar to "domestication", in the Venuttian sense, than to "foriegnization" i.e. his way of translation attempts to endow thoughts and images of the text with familiarity so as to become easily acceptable to the readership. (p.p. 16-17).

What distinguishes Edward Said from other English-writing authors of Arabic origin is that, whilst they used western tools of analysis to understanding problems of the Arab world, Edward Said used those tools for analyzing and understanding the western thought itself, which makes the task of translating certain texts of Edward Said, foremost of which is *Orientalism*, doubly difficult, and in need of many interventions of the translators including additions to the text like comments, footnotes, etc.

Orientalism was translated in no less than 35 languages, including Arabic. The only Arabic translation of the book between 1981-2006 was that of the well-known critic and writer Kamal Abu-Dīb . Today we have a new version of Arabic translation by Anani 2006 which is not yet available to most readers. Undoubtedly, the Arabic translation of Abu-Dib is more faithful than some other translations, but it was criticized for not being eloquent (خميس, 1991) and for being inexact (سعيد, 2004); moreover, no revised edition of the translation has been issued until 2006; the sixth impression (2003) is identical with the original edition (1981), with the same errata and misprints!

This paper aims to prove, through comparison instances of the two translations, that the criticism and recommendations of the thesis are justified and also that the translation of Anani meets most of the requirements of its recommendations.

The inclination of Abu-Dīb to the literal approach in translation, underpinned by his structural convictions, and his over-ambitious goals in that direction are expected to be at the expense of the eloquence (سلاسة) and easiness of comprehension by Arab readership. Such a state of affairs is expected to affect negatively the various linguistic dimensions; the thesis was meant to validate this proposition, by manifesting cases of translation inappropriateness on different levels, interpreting the results and providing alternative forms whenever possible.

The paper cites typical instances of the difficulties in the TT different linguistic dimensions in Abu-Dib's translation comparing it with Annani's translation, that make Arabic readers' efforts in understanding the text or the message it was written to convey neither efficient nor effective; these dimensions are:

- 1) The graphic dimension.
- 2) The word dimension and inconsistency dimension
- 3) The syntactic dimension.
- 4) The semantic dimension.
- 5) The pragmatic dimension.

The Graphic Dimension

Chief among the errors and inaccuracies in the graphic dimension, from which Abu-Dib's translation suffers and from which Anani's translation is almost free, we have the following:

- a) Use of *hamzat ul-katç* instead of *hamzat ul-waşl* in nouns, verbs and articles;
- b) Inconsistency in transliteration and rendering of proper names;
- c) Negligence of punctuation marks and
- d) High frequency of misprints

Table 1

Said's Words (P.L)	Abu-Dib's Translation (P.L)	Annani's translation (P.L)	Suggested Form
Look 32/37	أنظر 64/24	انظروا 86/16	انظر
occupation 35/35	للإحتلال 67/12	للاحتلال 15/90	للاحتلال
, he said, 31/5	قال.. أن 63/4	فقال إنها 4/83	قال...إن

Edgar Quinet 42/26-27, 79/21	ادوارد كوينت 106/13 ادغر كوينت 73/14	إدجار كينييه 6/100 إدجار كينييه 10/151	إدغر كينييه
Xerxes 56/7	كسيركسس 86/4	أرتخششا 4/119 (كسرى)	كسرى
"subject races" 36/22	العروق الخاضعة 67/34	"الأجناس المحكومة" 14/91	"العروق الخاضعة"
Raj 42/20	رجلا 73/9	أمير هندي 25/99	راجا/مهراجا

The Word Dimension

The most serious problems in the Word dimension in Abu-Dib's translation are:

- His use of regional (Syrian) words and words he invented by himself;
- Non-standard words i.e. words whose use is not accepted by classical Arabic due to lexical, morphological or collocational considerations.

Table 2

Said's Words (P.L)	Abu-Dib's Translation (P.L)	Annani's translation (P.L)	Suggested Form
focus 2/27	محرقتها الرئيسي 38/12-13	موضوعها الرئيسي 26/44	بؤرتها الرئيسية
pattern 6/13	نسق 41/20	نسق 25/49	نمط
credibility 11/7	جدارتها بالقبول 45/25	مصداقيتها 18/56	مصداقيتها
validity 52/32	سلامة 82/28	صحة 8/114	سريانية/صدق
resources 187/38	مصادر 200/18	موارد 1/301	موارد
broadly speaking 284/27	بصورة عريضة 285/1	بصفة عامة 14/435	بوجه عام
analyses 14/39	تحليل 49/5	التحليلات 21/61	التحليلات
Together 41/41	وكان ما يضم هذا الملف إلى بعضه بعضا 27/72	كان يربط المواد الأرشيفية بعضها إلى بعض 6/99	وكان ما يضم هذا الملف بعضه إلى بعض
available 73/21	متوفر 8/101	متاحة 25/142	متوافر
instance 290/6	مثلا 6/290	مثالا 3/443	على سبيل المثال
answer to	الإجابة على 16/154	الإجابة على 19/226	الإجابة عن

134/3			
-------	--	--	--

The Syntactic Dimension

This dimension may be considered the main cause of the loss of eloquence in Abu-Dib's translation. The major problems here are:

- Use of long complex sentences in the TT. For example; the first sentence of the book: "on a visit..... Nerval" was translated by Abu-Dib in a long whole sentence: "في زيارة لبيروت... نرفال"
- Unacceptable separation of grammatical dependencies ,
- Not following the familiar order of parts of speech in the sentence
- Not following the grammatical rules of classical Arabic.

Table 3

Said's Words (P.L)	Abu-Dib's Translation (P.L)	Annani's translation (P.L)	Suggested Form
So unequal are Oriental to European achievements 152/33	درجة من التفاوت بين منجزات الشرق ومنجزات الغرب عظيمة 169/28	إذ ما أعظم التفاوت بين المنجزات الشرقية والمنجزات الأوروبية 20/251	درجة عظيمة من التفاوت
Of course 46/22-24	طبعاً يتحدث 76/32	ويضاف إلى ذلك، بطبيعة الحال، أنه يتكلم....	يتحدث طبعاً
replaced with 139/12	تستبدل الآن بشيء جديد 158/22	يحل محلها 20/233	يستبدل بها الآن شيء جديد
younger 299/8	الأصغر سناً من 298/8	الأصغر سناً من 27/455	من هم أصغر سناً من
....the better 70/25	كلما كان... كلما كانت 98/18	وكلما ازداد... فهمك 25/138	كلما كان...، كانت

might have had 7/23	قد شكل 21/42	قد تكون 18/51	ربما يكون قد شكل
Is continuously being 285/27	التي يحشر 27- 28/285	يفرضونها عليه فرضاً 22/436	التي مازال يحشر
and was as much a part 140/40	جزءاً 6/160	وكانت تمثل جانبا من 1-2/236	وكان جزءاً
an idea 231/4	فكرة 5/239	وهي الفكرة التي 3/359	وهي فكرة

The Semantic Dimension

The most important problems in the semantic dimension in Abu-Dib's translation are:

- Ellipses which may be whole phrases or even sentences ;
- Inaccurate translation especially of foreign words and expressions;
- Metaphorical expressions;
- Redundancy realized by using two words of different meaning for the same word.

Table 4

Said's Words (P.L)	Abu-Dib's Translation (P.L)	Annani's translation (P.L)	Suggested Form
Since he knows their history 34/37	66/16 --	يعرف تاريخهم واعتمادهم على رجال من أمثالهم 8/89	ما دام يعرف تاريخهم
Access 122/5	فانضأ 144/26	أصبحت متاحة 17/210	توصلاً
Rent 215/4	أجور 225/7-8	إيجارات الأراضي 13/336	ربوع
Meted out to him 68/22	خُصَّ به 96/26	حكم به عليه 4/136	فَيُضُّ له / فُدِّر له
Hold my peace	أحتفظ بسلامي 31/129	ألتزم الصمت 17/189	ألتزم الصمت
<i>australes</i> 117/8	الاسترالية 140/23	الأراضي الجنوبية	الجنوبية

		8/203	
"Mahometsgesan g" 101/40	"نهضة محمد" 124/28	ترنيمه محمد 4/181	/ "تراتيل تسبيجات محمد"
Rapporteur 162/28	موقّق ومقرّب 178/23	"راوية" 21/265	مقرّر
Qualify 72/18	أو يسوّغها يدعمها 100/3	وضع شرائط أو صفات	/ يقيدھا يخصصھا

The Pragmatic Dimension

The most important problems from which the translation of Abu-Dib suffers are:

- Difference in intention;
- Hedging and
- Implicature, where knowledge of the reader of the context is not taken into consideration.
- Stress

Table 5

Said's Words (P.L)	Abu-Dib's Translation (P.L)	Annani's translation (P.L)	Suggested Form
Legitimist 124/2	من أنصار الشرعية 146/9	السلطة الشرعية 4/213	من أنصار الملكية (المنهل + السياق)
The new historical (as opposed to sacred) consciousness 126/28	الوعي التاريخي في مقابل الوعي المقدس الجديد 148/15	الوعي التاريخي الجديد (بدلا من الوعي المقدس) 17/216	الوعي التاريخي الجديد (بدلا من الوعي المقدس)
More or less 4/12	ما لا نهاية 39/28	حتى ما تبدو لها نهاية 7/47	ما لا نهاية تقريبا
Can't possibly 301/15	لا يمكن 300/3	لا تستطيع على الإطلاق التأثير في 6/459	ربما لا يمكن

Scholiasts 262/5	المدارسيين 265/27	كتاب الحواشي على المتون 403/21	(شراح، مفسرون) (Webster)
al-Iji 313/7	العجي 312/20	الأيجي 478/26	الإيجي (□□□□□□)
Prester John 63/22	برستر جون 92/23	جون بريست 129/13	ملك صليبي أسطوري (Encyclopedia Britannica)
Xerxes 56/7	كسر كسيس 86/4	كسرى 119/8	كسرى
away from 171/2	تتأى عن 185/24	من انطلافا 277/12	□□ □□□□

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- 1) This paper adds evidence to the conclusions of my thesis "Abu-Dib's Translation of *Orientalism*: A Critical Study" regarding the failure of Abu-Dib's translation to convey the message of *Orientalism* by Edward Said effectively and appropriately.
- 2) The "Suggested forms" given in my thesis for replacing inaccurate words or expressions in Abu-Dib's translation of *Orientalism* are almost identical to the corresponding expressions in Anani's translation, in the majority of cases in the sample of the study.
- 3) The paper strongly recommends adopting Anani's translation for purposes of reference and research.
- 4) Being true representatives of the foreignization and domestication schools in translation, the translations of *Orientalism* by Abu-Dib and Anani may be duly utilized in teaching translation courses in English Departments in Palestinian universities, which this study strongly recommends.

References:

- : : .(2006) . -
- .5 : .(2003) . -
- : : .(1977) . -
- - . -
- Said, E. (2003). *Orientalism*. London: Penguin Books.
 - Hamad, N. (2006). *Abu-Dib's Translation of Orientalism: A Critical Study*. Master thesis.